LATE S. M. ALI

DHAKA THURSDAY SEPTEMBER 19, 2002

JS concludes in a chaos

Nation pays MPs dearly only to hear mutual acrimony

E spend nearly taka three hundred crore to hold elections. Then we pay our MPs salary, allowances (including money for telephone bills that many never pay), tax-free cars (the quota per head may be increased from one to two, without any protest from either side of the House). We are now contemplating giving them offices with two staff members in their respective constituencies. In exchange what do our MPs give us? The least said the better. The minimum we expect is a reflection of public concerns in their speeches. What did we get in the last four days? Simply self-praise, and opponent bashing. When we were told that there would be debate on the law and order situation we naturally felt happy that finally our representatives will talk about a problem that is crippling our lives, our economy, our children and obviously our

To start with, the Treasury Bench unnecessarily dillydallied in starting the debate. On the first day it contrived a postponement and on the second it delayed it without a debate on point of order. These are all acceptable parliamentary tactics but quite wasteful for us, particularly when people really want the topic to be discussed. Finally when the so-called debate did come to surface, what did we hear except mutual recrimination and time wasted on personal explanation? It all got started when one treasury bencher made an accusatory remark against the former home minister, Md. Nasim. In his reply he attacked the accuser and three other BNP ministers, who then had to be given chances to reply. These ministers in turn in their replies made vicious attacks against Nasim, who then wanted time again to reply. Thus our much-awaited debate on law and order got mired in abuse and counter-abuse being hurled at each other and nothing that we wanted discussed ever got talked about.

About the last day's speech of the Leader of the Opposition one must admit that the Speaker really tried to give a lot of time to her. He first intervened after 50 minutes of continuous speaking by Sheikh Hasina. Most of the greatest parliament speeches in world history were made in less time than that. If Sheikh Hasina really wanted she could have said everything important, relevant and necessary within that time. But she did not, and made her speech unnecessarily long and thereby warranting Speaker's intervention and ruling party objection. However the treasury bench should have allowed the Speaker to handle the situation himself without creating chaos and confusion and reducing the House to a free for all shouting match. In parliamentary practice, especially in case of concluding speeches the two leaders -- of the House and of the opposition -- are usually given as much time as they wish. So a good precedent could have been set.

The good thing was that the opposition stayed throughout and made use (more of it was abuse) of the forum to say their piece. We noticed a new determination on its part to work from within the parliament, for which we commend them and urge them to continue with it. Never should they leave the House of the People, which is what

However, we must point out to both sides that they must stop wasting taxpayers' money in mutual acrimony and focus on issues. Opposition should realise that much can be said, and often more damaging things, without being personal and offensive. Sometimes a calmer and sober presentation carry more weight with the audience. More can be put across when viewers. listeners and readers see that the approach was fair, factual and constructive rather than aggressive, rhetorical and abusive. The treasury bench on the other hand must realise that using parliamentary tactics to prevent the opposition from speaking or speaking at the right time may look clever but ultimately it proves self-defeating. People are wise enough to draw their own conclusions.

We conclude by reminding our honourable MPs that the taxpayers are becoming impatient with your performance. We see no acrimony, no debate, not even the minutest sign of dissent when it comes to increasing their perks. But when it comes to our issues and our concerns sessions are cut to four days because there are no 'issues' to necessitate a longer session. At the end when law and order was admitted for a debate, only one hour was officially allocated for it. Can this be credible that our parliament could only spare one hour for a debate on law and order? Who are we fooling? Only ourselves.

Governance -- the prime concern

KAZI ANWARUL MASUD

ICHOTOMOUS political contrast prevailing in Bangladesh today is increasingly contributing to a sharp polarization among the people, not so much based on ideological persuasion but on one's attempts to regain lost power and the other's equal determination to frustrate all attempts of this quest. In this conflictual situation the welfare of the people, in whose name all the battles are being fought gets little, if at all, attention. Indeed, albeit reluctantly, one is tempted to agree with the skeptical view that politics is the conduct of public affairs for private advantages. Politics is normal and natural in modern society because humans are social beings and their interactions both within and without the boundaries of a defined geographical area have to be regulated by certain rules. Politicians may be itinerants and eclection in their views but they are crystal clear in their understanding that real politics are the possession and distribution of power" (Benjamir Disraeli). Their real indifference to public misery has plateued to such an extent that no degree of opprobrium would affect their conduct and conscience. In his article Omar Khasru (Politics of Being and Nothingness-DS-August 28th) drawing on Jean Paul Satre's theory has aptly described the politicians of the day as constantly falling into "bad faith"; evading responsibility for their (mis)deeds; and thus creating a

Ethics apparently has taken a holiday these days. Senseless murders, mindless violence, countless assassination of moral values with society playing the role of a silent chronicler bear sad testimony to the unethical dorsal column of societal character. Why must dissenting voices be muted -- be they electronic or human? After all democratic pluralism is enshrined in our constitution. Human Development Report 2002 analyzing governance crisis has identified, inter-alia, widespread corruption as one of the indicators. For the second successive year Bangladesh has been

breach between promises and

performance

ranked as the most corrupt country in Corruption Perception Index(CPI) 2002 by the Berlin-based Transparency International. TI has defined corruption as "the abuse of public office for private gain". To be fair TI revealed that developed countries assisted the spread of corruption in developing countries. Its Bribery Payers Index(BPI) 2002 stated that firms from Russia, China, Taiwan and South Korea closely followed by Italy, Hongkong, Malaysia, Japan, USA and France figured prominently despite the fact that many of these countries were signatories to Anti-Bribery Convention(DS-August 29th).

The Human Development Report has defined the goals of good governance as respect for

unto the next elections.

less elite imposing their will and whims and trodding upon the dignity of the people with careless abandon. Human development in the words of Aung San Suu Kyi "demands constant effort and capacity for rethinking, flexibility and fast reactions. Hopeless, helpless people stripped of their dignity are hardly capable of such activities. And so we return to the link between human development and human dignity" (page 52 HDR 2002). One consoling part of the Report is that GDP per capita for Bangladesh calculated under purchasing power parity scheme at US\$1602 is more than that of Nepal and Bhutan and close to that of Pakistan. As is well known Purchasing Power Parity Theory (put forward by Cassel

police, politicians and law; development and increased efficiency of infra-structure and utilities; distribution of business ownership from few hands to many as some of the measures necessary to improve our global competitiveness.

Perhaps donors' perception of lack of good governance and slow implementation of reforms have significantly reduced inflow of foreign aid, Consequently Bangladesh had to take the high moral ground; first by stating that we would like to opt out of LDC club(thus forfeiting various advantages the country has been entitled to get as an LDC), and then proclaiming the necessity to rely on internal resources. Net result has been increasing taxes -- both direct and

explain away the Spartan life being led by the political leaders just across the border as opposed to the opulent life style (by Bangladesh standard) of our leaders

In this cash scarce situation privatization of state owned enterprises (SOE) has once again become the favourite slogan of the government to get out of the economic difficulties. In the implementation of this process, perhaps, not much attention has been given to the social costs while divesting the SOEs. Undeniably successive governments cannot go on financing loss incurring enterprises ad infinitum. It is therefore logical that such enterprises should be privatized. Prof. Rehman Sobhan (Privatization in Bangladesh: An Agenda in

about US\$5 billion which our private sector cannot afford or alternatively give away in the post-MFA era the RMG sector to India and China who already preside over large integrated textile industry.

While management of the economy remains an integral part of good governance, such governance also embraces socio-political aspects (page 51 HDR 2002). If one were to posit that the West has reached the anotheosis of democratic values and the USA has become the hegemon (now being doubted over its wisdom of Iraq policy): then external dosage of conditionality would have to be interpolated in the governance policy of the "lesser" states. As Ziauddin Sardar has arqued colonization known as "westernization" and now going under the name of "globalization" is transforming the world into the proverbial "global villages", rapidly shrinking distances, compressing space and time, and shaping the world in the image of a single culture and civilization. Further on the intensification of globalization would usher in the era of post-modernism and postdevelopmentalism in which a "small minority of regions would control the vast majority of material resources and technologies. In doing so they would not only reproduce uneven development, they also would compel underdeveloped regions to participate in a system that prioritizes commercialistic exchange-value consideration over popular wee-being" (Dennis O'Hearn -- Tigers and Multi-national Corporations). In such a global scenario it would, perhaps, be advisable for our leaders to gain deep insight into the world of tomorrow and our place in that matrix, instead of extending their tunnel vision unto the next elections. If Iraq and Afghanistan are anything to go by (as examples of nation-states and not for their delinquency) then politico-economic regionalism would better serve our interests in the long run regardless of the people wielding power in Bangladesh.

Kazi Anwarul Masud is a retired Secretary to the

While management of the economy remains an integral part of good governance, such governance also embraces socio-political aspects (page 51 HDR 2002). If one were to posit that the West has reached the apotheosis of democratic values and the USA has become the hegemon (now being doubted over its wisdom of Iraq policy); then external dosage of conditionality would have to be interpolated in the governance policy of the "lesser" states...it would, perhaps, be advisable for our leaders to gain deep insight into the world of tomorrow and our place in that matrix, instead of extending their tunnel vision

fundamental rights and freedom; accountability of the rulers: fair rules, institutions and practices governing social interactions; nondiscrimination based on race, ethnicity, class, gender or any other attributes; need of future generations to be reflected in current policies; responsiveness of economic and social policies to people's needs and aspirations; eradication of poverty; people having a say in decisions affecting their lives etc. It is a tall order to measure up to these standards. Even countries with long tradition of uninterrupted democratic practice (e.g. India and Sri Lanka) have not fared very well within the overall context of the Report. In Human Development Index 2002 Bangladesh ranked 145 out of 173 countries surveyed (Maldives at 84.Sri Lanka 89. India 124, Pakistan 128, Bhutan 140, and

Some countries appear to be mired in hopelessness where time has stood still for eternity; the basic fundamental human rights of the people are asphyxiated by a ruthbetween 1919-25) tries to explain the determination of exchange rates between countries when rates are free to fluctuate. The method tried to demonstrate that rate of exchange depended on the relative purchasing power of currencies in their home countries. However, in the HDR 2002 which provides thirty indicators of human development Bangladesh has not fared very well. Misfortune has been further compounded by information relating to Bangladesh in the latest HDR having been complimented by the findings of Global Competitiveness Report 2002 by the Centre for Policy Dialogue. CPD Executive Director Dr. Debapriva Bhattacharva (DS-August 28th) felt that Bangladesh government needed to focus on some micro-economic issues. In the previous GCR by World Economic Forum Bangladesh ranked 71 out of 75 countries surveyed. Dr. Bhattacharya suggested that continuation of economic reforms; control over crime (racketeering and extortion cause significant loss to business); restoring public trust in

indirect with the incidence of taxes mainly being borne by the middleincome group. Though some of the initial budget proposals have been withdrawn/amended, popular perception of the current budget is that it is a "rich man's budget". Price of utilities is now being raised every six months. While it is generally accepted that tax-GDP ratio is very low in Bangladesh, it has to be borne in mind that capacity to pay tax by the middle and low income groups is also very limited. In sharp contradistinction lies the reported news of the Members of Parliament now being able to import duty free two vehicles in place of one which hitherto had been their privilege. Sadly, people would have expected more mature decision from their law makers, no less in view of the fact that the Chief Minister of West Bengal lives in an 800 sq feet flat with his mother, wife and daughter, the flat has two bed rooms; his wife who works in a private firm goes to her office in a pick-up van provided by her office and not by the West Bengal government. It is difficult to

available evidence, a decade and a half of exposure to a vigorous and donor assisted programme of privatization has yielded few benefits to Bangladesh economy. With a few exceptions, privatized units have not significantly improved performance but have contributed to enterprise closures and disemployment. Private sector default to the banks has increased exponentially whilst private banks have been characterized by more adverse loan portfolios than the NCBs and have been maledicted to large scale under trading. In such circumstances, prudence among the policy makers and even amongst ideologically committed donors would have dictated some caution in the current drive to privatize both the SOEs as well as the NCBs". Referring to the expiry of the Multi-Fibre Agreement in 2005 Prof. Sobhan wonders whether Bangladesh government should not step in to set up new weaving and spinning mills involving an investment of

Search of Policy-Paper 16-CPD)

concluded, "On the basis of the

the country had already gained from

Nine/eleven: Impact on Pakistan



M.J. ZAHEDI

director general. Inter-Services Intelligence, has said, the Americans were now demanding to use Paki-American command'. Naturally, the Pakistan Press has carried a lot about the September 11, 2001. incidents. They are doing so even

now. The Press and other media

have not stopped writing about what

happened in America on September

11 last year and how the tragic

events have affected the world as

well as Pakistan. The most damage

has mostly been on the economy

According to one estimate, at least

one hundred thousand iobs have

been lost in the tourist industry

alone. The slow-down in the world

economy has also had its impact on

Pakistan's economy. For example, it

has affected the demand for Paki-

stani exports like textile and carpets.

In 2001, Pakistan's total exports

were only nine billion US dollars

against the target of ten billion. Pakistanis have diverse opinions as a human tragedy, some see its impact on the world's economy as a tragedy that has left consequences deprivation, foreign occupation. repression and denial of human rights. The paper quoted commentators as maintaining that the 'war on terrorism' has ended 'talibanising' the West itself. The conflict has been termed a battle between two extremisms, with the protagonists refusing to see any shades of grey. The

government was taking steps prior to September 11 events to correct the country's economy. Reserves were building in 2001and economic reforms had started to work well before the 9/11 scenario. The general positive direction helped Pakistan handle the post-9/11 shocks better. The IMF also helped by

IMF help and removal of economic by EU and US. The country now has a comfortable position with regard to reserves and all other indicators, such as revenue, exports, imports, inflation, stabilization in exchange rate and performing well during the first two months period (July-August) of the current fiscal year (2002-2003). A strong base has been government -- the future government will be in a position to achieve goal of prosperity during the democratic regimes, despite the lingering military stand off between Pakistan and India which has also burdened Pakistan's economy and the govern-

confidence. The September 2001 attacks had a profound impact on Pakistan's

ment's efforts to restore investor-

M J Zahedi is an eminent columnist in Pakistan and

on the war. Some think it has gone stan in the hunt for Al Qaida 'by placing Pakistani troops under sour for the Americans, some see it



INCE last year the world has changed immensely. On September 11, 2001, terror attacks were made in America. But the attacks were not only in America alone. The entire world had been 'hit' by the explosions that occurred in Washington and New York. Countries near and far were indirectly affected by the blasts. Since then the world has undergone tremendous change, not physically though. The incidents that happened on September 11, 2001, have left far-reaching effects on global and national politics, economy and values. Of course, the biggest sufferers are the Americans themselves: their values and

civil liberties have been damaged. Pakistan too has lost a great deal. For example, the Kashmir case has fallen a victim of the Americans' new approach to the world order. As retired General Hamid Gul, a former

of vital importance for many years to

come, some say it has created a new

turn in political and economic history.

On the economic side, it has

increased the risks of the world

for the West. It said, unfortunately,

to recession.

LETTER FRÖM KARACHI

The negative effects started fading in post-April 2002 period as the country had already gained

from IMF help and removal of economic sanctions and more market access by EU and US. The country now has a comfortable position with regard to reserves and all other indicators, such as revenue, exports, imports, inflation, stabilization in exchange rate and performing well during the first two months period (July-August) of the current fiscal year (2002-2003). conflict is reminiscent also of the

kindergarten after-school fights: you

are either with us or against us. The

only difference is that one group has

the most devastating firepower moving towards dangerously close mankind has ever known. According to one estimate Paki-On the political side, as daily 'The stan has suffered a loss of US \$3 News' put it, September 11 has helped invent a new 'evil' adversary billion during the last one year. But the subsequent removal of economic sanctions and increased instead of addressing the root access to the EU market helped rally causes of 'terrorism', the Western the economy. And experts see future powers, led by the USA, seem determined to aggravate these prospects of stronger economic position of the country after the causes. President Pervez Musharraf upcoming October elections. The has identified these as economic

providing more funds. According to a senior official of the Pakistan Finance Ministry, the economy faced adverse shocks during October-March period after the 9/11 incidents. It affected Pakistan in the shape of dwindling exports and revenue etc. The economy faced losses in the short term. Apprehensions that Pakistan may be declared a war zone also had adverse effects on exports. Further adverse effects on the economy came when India deployed troops across the border.

But the negative effects started fading in post-April 2002 period as

EDITOR TO THE EDITOR TO THE EDITOR

history, changing the policies and priorities of the world. What the US has achieved in Afghanistan has had deep impact on Pakistan and the entire region. The adverse effects as well as the lingering military standoff between Pakistan and India also burdened the economy. But one hopes that the political government that will take power after the October elections, will be in a position to achieve the goal of prosperity.

formerly the Editor of the Khaleez Times.

overall knowledge in Bangla is

sound. Of course it varies from

that to be versed in any subject one

should read or practice more and

more. And it is our duty to make our

children get interested in Bangla

Both the school authority and

guardians should play the role.

came across some parents who feel

proud of saying that their children

don't want to read Bengali. This is

books available in Bangla and

during vacation or when the exam is

over we can encourage our children

to read these books. In this way

their reading habit will grow and

their knowledge in Bengali will

enrich. Apart from this, we can also

encourage them to read Bengal

There are many interesting

In this regard, I would like to say

school to school

really unfortunate.

TO THE EDITOR TO THE EDITOR TO THE

"Bush. Bangladesh and 9/11"

This is in reference to the letter by ES, Missouri, USA (September 16). Our friend expects us to condemn the terrorist attack on WTC. Yes, we do. But why should the Bangladesh government send a message of solidarity when the Americans did not do so in Bangladesh's time of need (the Liberation War of 1971)?

It's been a year after the notorious attacks on USA but it's been YEARS since the crisis in the Middle East began! Has or does anvone mourn the deaths arising out of the situation? Dhaka

This refers to the letter of Mr ES. If what ES complains about, lack of gesture of condolence from Bangladesh on 9/11, is indeed true; I feel very proud that for once Bangladesh has shown to the rest of the world that we may be poor, we may be the most corrupt but when it comes to being fare on issues, we are at the top. Bangladesh does not

differentiate between loss of lives of human beings, may it be in the USA, Afghanistan, Palestine or Iraq for that matter. We would like the civilised nations of the world to take our silence on the issue as a protest against American double standard. If President Bush is a true Christian, he must know that in the eyes of the lord, we are all equal!

As for what our Prime Minister is going to tell the members of the US congress, I suggest she tell them exactly what was said above. As for you, Mr ES, please do not develop a tunnel vision"(you see only what you want to see and not what is actually there to see) like all Americans, just because you are living in America. Your "whole civilised world" belongs to the hypocrites; that is all the more reason for us to show respect to the event by remaining silent. **A Thinker**

'Criminal' commis-

sioner? I fail to understand why you have made such a huge issue out of the Commissioner Shahid affair. Murderer or not, if he can be voted to the post by the people of his ward, why can't he take oath? By voting him to power, the

And for the rest of us, haven't we all voted lesser or larger versions of Shahid to parliament? So why the

people have clearly made a choice

i.e. they want to see Shahid at

Daiyaan Murshed Mogbazar, Dhaka

'AL on wheatscam'

The news item on AL probe report about wheatscam is a good sign in our political horizon

A party out of office has submitted their findings on a matter of current issue after an investigation. They might have tried to belittle their opponents, but the cards are on the

Your front-page report on September 11 is sufficiently detailed and to the point. The affected persons/party can give their reply similarly point by point. If the trend is upheld and reciprocated our politicians can get back the respect of the people they represent. The politicians should avoid vague accusations and sweeping comments. There are ways to make hartals extinct.

Of murder and murderer

Recently the verdict of the murder of Jibran Tayobee, an Indian citizen killed in Chittagong by professional murderers, has been given. Out of the seven accused persons, five got life imprisonment and two went scot-free

The professional murderers who kill people for money are surely the most despicable persons and deserve capital punishment. But those who employ them, lure them to commit such crime, are more guilty. Why aren't these people who remain behind the curtain brought to justice?

Chittagong

"Great Army"

While growing up, war and warriors used to fascinate us most. We used

to spend our leisure time grouped around listening to some amazing and bizarre stories with eyes wide open. And one such story in every civilisation would always be heard with endless interest -- each time with a new outlook. A story of a great army of a great nation supposedly housed, fed, trained very secretly underground. They would never see the daylight nor would come in contact with any other soul. They would only be released and surfaced at the most critical time and the great army would eat up any and all living creatures around them. The story-teller would vouch on the authenticity

I suppose the time has come for our great army to go underground --I mean garrisoned sub surface, at least away from Dhaka to avoid all the sense and sensibility befalling on them.

I wonde what could be the substitute to a great army in that case? Tanzia Chowdhury

Vox Populi's letter on "Great Army (August 31) offers a new argument. The letter pointed out that the armed force follow some discriminatory practice while renting auditoriums -- the civil officials have to pay almost 4 times more than the uniformed people

Just to mention the charges of "Sena Kunja" -- the armed force is required to pay about Taka 20,000 or so whereas the civil officials pay about Tk 84,000 for the same place. In the BDR Darbar Hall, the civil officials pay about Tk 60,000 whereas the armed forces people pay about Tk 15000 or so.

Why this discriminatory practice between the two sets of government officials when both are serving the same authority? Mohammad sharif Dhanmondi, Dhaka

This is a reply to the letter from the Man in Uniform stating that the information regarding Bangladeshi troops in Bosnia is incorrect. The information I read from transcripts from a session of the United King-

dom Parliament. Here is the paragraph from the site: "It is worth reminding ourselves when we talk about Europe and NATO that not only Western Europe Bangladeshis, the Kenyans or the New Zealanders serving in Bosnia. Of course our own troops must be our first priority and interest in the context of military action and changing the mandate, but we must not forget that the United Nations has gone to a great deal of expense and spent a great deal of time in ensuring that some of these troops are adequately kitted out. Some time ago, there were reports of Bangladeshi troops in the Bihac

is involved. We should not forget the

changing the mandate in context." After reading that, I searched for information on the issue over the net and several other sites stated that one-fourth of the Bangladeshi troops were armed. Is the British parliamentarian and the international press lying? I ask the Man in Uniform to reply Rashid Chowdhury

enclave with one rifle between four

men. That puts the difficult task of

"Of English and Bangla'

My son studies in a reputed English

The school authority should also be careful and serious in teaching Bengali-- our mother tongue. Naturally, in an English medium school Bengali teaching might be less prioritised. But it shouldn't be this

Areader Medium school and I think his

newspaper