HE draft Public Administra-tion Training Policy" (PATP) has been approved by the National Training Council on December 20, 2000 (Draft **Public Administration Training** Policy approved, DS, December 21, 2000). The draft PATP envisages "an accountable and innovative administration capable of delivering quality and costeffective services to the people. It is claimed that PATP "has been framed with a view to enhancing the capability of the public administrative system to analyse, develop and implement national policies, plans, and programmes." One of the objectives of the draft PATP is to build up "an effective, innovative, accountable, transparent, honest and committed public service."

Draft PATP vis-à-vis Performance

Numerous assessments and professional studies have identified the glaring deficiencies of public administration training (PAT) institutions and programmes in Bangladesh. Notwithstanding the creation of Bangladesh Public Administration Training Centre (BPATC) in 1984, the successive ments have miserably failed to improve the performance of the moribund state of training institutions. It has always been difficult to effectively assess either the appropriateness or the impact of the training programmes catered by various training institutions in terms of measurable improvements in the performance of public personnel and organisations. The draft PATP contains nothing which may lead to a revamped training delivery system. No amount of lofty pronouncements can substitute for a comprehensive NTP which is capable providing guidance to the PAT institutions for designing and implementing job relevant training programmes.

Given the fact that the draft PATP claims to improve the "capability of the public service" through training, the time is also ripe to discuss or explore the critical issues related to bureaucratic efficiency, competence, responsiveness and accountability vis-a-vis the proposed objectives of the draft PATP. performance of Bangladesh's public bureaucracy or the civil service or public service or public administration (using these terms synonymously or interchangeably) may be evaluated with reference to the following criteria or standards: efficiency. effectiveness, political neutral ity, responsiveness, accountability, transparency, honesty, and commitment to public service.

The term 'efficiency' may be defined as the ratio between input and output. Hence the concept of efficiency is directly related to the productivity of various public (governmental) Efficiency is concerned with "the relationship between inputs and outputs, usually expressed in a ratio per unit of an output." There are more employees in each of the organizations of Bangladesh Government. With the existence of a disproportionate number of class III and IV employees, the public bureaucracy has remained bloated over a long period of time. Whatever way one may define 'efficiency', or 'productivity', the public bureaucracies in Bangladesh are inefficient or unproductive. In fact, there is a consensus among the scholars and informed individuals that cies are fundamentally inefficient. In the absence of any major restructuring via substantial downsizing of the bloated bureaucracies, not a single lofty pronouncement of the draft PATP can create condition for creating an efficient bureaucracy in Ban-

'Effectiveness' is related to the competence of an employee. In other words, it relates to how well the public bureaucracies can accomplish the predetermined goals and objectives.

Effectiveness is "concerned with the extent to which a programme is achieving or failing to achieve its stated objectives. "Effectiveness measures are outcome-oriented; they focus on the real changes the programme produce." Given the fact that public bureaucracies are known for incompetence, red-tape and procrastination, the civil servants are ineffective by definition. There is convincing evidence to suggest that many of the government officers got the basis of qualification for the job. Most of them have been retained, tenured and promoted without adequate reference to their performance on the job. Unfortunately, most of these civil servants are not even amenable to training. In spite of the fact that certain

batches of the recruits in the civil service were contaminated due to political pressure, there is no doubt that appropriately designed training programmes can increase the level of effectiveness of the mainstream civil service. Managerial competencies can be transmitted or acquired through the design and implementation of specifically tailored competency-based training programmes. Yet, neither the NTC nor the Ministry of Establishment could devise any comprehensive training policy for linking training to the effectiveness of the civil service system. The draft PATP contains nothing but some self-serving statements about improving the competence through training. The truth of the matter is that most of the PAT institutions in Bangladesh lack appropriately qualified instructors to design and carry out job-relevant training programmes. The draft PAT has not devised ways and means for conducting training programmes.

The concept of 'political neutrality' ensures that public bureaucrats will deliberately employ their "neutral compe-(the belief that a neutral public bureaucracy following the mandates of legislative body will meet the requirements of democracy) in discharging their assigned duties and responsibilities. In other words, public administrators need to be nonpartisan in performing or delivering public service. Although political neutrality is the capstone of any merit-based civil service system, most of Bangladesh's civil servants can no longer claim to be non-partisan. Neither the present Government nor the previous governments can claim to have sincerely pursued or nurtured a deliberate policy of political neutrality. All of the regimes have conveniently employed the civil service for the purpose pursuing, promoting and furthering partisan goals and objectives. There is no doubt that the hard core segment of the civil service has remained to be closed system. Yet, there are glaring instances of total sell out

DRAFT PUBLIC ADMINISTRATION TRAINING POLICY

Does it Offer a Better Bureaucracy?

By M. Waheeduzzaman Manik in Tennessee

of certain civil servants to the political patronage in the form of lucrative postings, quick promotions, and extension of services beyond retirement age.

In such a politically loaded environment, there exists no possibility of ensuring political neutrality of a heavily politicised bureaucracy through designing and implementing any training programme.

'Responsiveness' refers to how quickly the bureaucracy responds to the needs of the eople. Responsiveness ensures that the public servants should make a deliberate determination that they remain constantly vigilant and attentive toward meeting the "demands of the citizenry" in a timely fashion. While this concept connotes that the public service should be responsive to the needs, priorities, and preferences of the public, responsiveness also relates to the concept of equity and justice as fairness. There is hardly any evidence to suggest that bureaucracies in Bangladesh are adequately responsive to meet the

ble for, their action or inaction. It is fair to suggest that Bangladesh's public bureaucrats are everything but accountable and responsible for most of their actions provided they have the blessings or endorsements of the political leadership in power. Given the continuation of perpetual political turmoil and uncertainties in Bangladesh, the ineffective political institutions, especially the Jatiya Sangsad, have thus far failed to develop meaningful control over the public bureaucracies. The introduction of legislative oversight of the bureaucracies through the use of Parliamentary Committee

held answerable to, or responsi-

accountable and responsible. 'Transparency' refers to the fact that decision-making process in public sector organisations can be seen through distinctly by the public. Transparency is equivalent to the concept of 'sunshine law' in the USA that

system is yet to be fully devel-

oped and recognised as an effec-

tive instrument for making the

politicised civil service more

be free from all forms of corruption, nepotism, favoritism, and embezzlement.

A number of credible studies and investigative reports clearly attest to the fact that corruption and illegal practices have penetrated all levels of the civil service system in Bangladesh Although there is a serious paucity of honest officers in the civil service, there is no dearth of dishonest officers who are not committed to the "public service." These officers may be found totally incompetent in accomplishing common purpose or public goals. Yet, they seem to have developed expertise in soliciting, accepting and managing bribery and other forms of largesse. Many of those corrupt officers even think that acceptance of larceny is their entitle-

Training in ethics can be initiated toward instilling an ethical or moral tone in Bangladesh's public bureaucracies. There are instances of using intervention techniques for been violated by the political leadership, especially the alleged manipulation of the results of the (BCS) examination ("20th BCS Examination: PSC Influenced by Ruling Party?" DS, November 20. 2000), has a serious negative impact on the very integrity and merit principle of the civil ser-

It is important to find out

Bangladesh Civil Service

Draft PATP vis-à-vis the State of PAT Institutions and Programs

whether or not the objectives of the draft PATP have any relevance toward improving the actual performance of the PAT institutions. One of the objectives of the draft PATP is "to ensure proper training facilities for the officials of all segments of the administration as well as public representatives." To that "the existing training institutions would be further strengthened by developing

of relevant training programmes. In fact, a variety of training institutions, both before and after the creation of BPATC, have been mainly responsible for "conducting" training programmes. The creation of BPATC in 1984 by amalgamating the Staff Training Institute (STI), the Civil Officers Training Academy (COTA), the National Institute of Public Administration (NIPA), and the Bangladesh Administrative Staff College (BASC), has led to the centralisation of the civil service training delivery system. Most of the core training programmes of the now-defunct STI, COTA, NIPA, and BASC are now catered by the BPATC. Besides, other

training institutes under various

Ministries and Divisions are also

providing training to the govern-

ment officers belonging to vari-

ous service cadres and functional

areas. Approximately two dozens

another "draft" of national train-

training institutes would be

created to cater the training

needs of the growing number of

civil servants. It will be welcome

by the PAT community if addi-

tional facilities are being created

toward improving the quality of

training programmes. However,

creation of more training insti-

tutes or, for that matter, even the

restructuring of the existing

training institutes does not nec-

essarily lead to the improvement

of the design and implementation

It is not vet clear whether new

ing policy.

or the class-one officers. While the Ministry of Establishment and the Ministries or Divisions or Departments concerned are "assumed" to be esponsible for "the assessment of training needs," "selection of trainees," and "post-training utilisation," the training institutions are primarily responsible for "the design," "implementation." and "evaluation" of training programmes. However, there is no convincing evidence to indicate that the MoE or any other government organisations have thus far pursued training objectives on the basis of any systematically assessed training needs analysis. MoE does not use any consistent and formalised criteria or procedures for the selection

Several professional studies and reports have suggested that most of the PAT institutions in Bangladesh which cater training programs "for class I officers of the Government operate well below 50 per cent of their capacity." More than 50 per cent of all of civil servants of Bangladesh Government have not yet completed the Foundation Course even after completing many years in the service. A whopping number of mid-career and senior-level officers have not yet received inservice training.

Conclusion

It is fair to suggest that there had been no dearth of PAT institutions, nor had there been a paucity of training programmes in Bangladesh even before the creation of BPATC. Yet, there are those informed individuals who have clearly pointed out that in establishment and institutional proliferation, the approaches to the design and implementation of the core PAT programmes have essentially

remained archaic and often irrelevant to the changing needs and priorities of a growing civil service. The decline of governmental capability to provide meaningful and relevant training to those who need it most has been one of the major disappointments of the '80s and '90s. It is, therefore, presumptuous at best, on the part of the NTC, to claim that the makeshift draft PATP will somehow be capable of providing an operational framework.

Given the fact that the training programmes are essentially irrelevant to meet the Training Needs (the discrepancy between the desired level of performance and the current level of performance) of the Government functionaries, the draft PATP's objective of building up "an effective, innovative, accountable, transparent, honest and committed public service" can be characterised as nothing but "paper boldness" or "paper picture.

However, the draft PATP has spelled out some useful objectives for systematising training efforts in Bangladesh. It is reassuring to see that the NTC recognised the pivotal role of imparting quality training toward developing and sustaining a quality civil service in Bangladesh. Yet, there is no shred of evidence to suggest that the government has developed any pragmatic plan for accomplishing the lofty goals and objec tives of the draft PATP. No action oriented guidelines exist for improving the design, implementation and evaluation of the job relevant training programs. Nor has there been any effort for initiating any meaningful posttraining utilisation plans or any revamped procedure for the systematic assessment of training needs, the selection of trainees, course curricula and lesson plans, trainers, training methods, and careful determination of procedures for evaluating the relevance and usefulness of the training programmes. Hopefully, various critical

issues that are necessary to improve the relevancy, adequacy, and appropriateness of the design, implementation, and evaluation of training programmes will be adequately addressed in the final version of PATP. To accomplish this end, concerted effort needs to be initiated soon by the NTC to develop a pragmatic, realitybased, and comprehensive NTP geared toward building up strong leadership and manage rial competencies in our public

The author is an Associate Professor and Coordinator in the Department of Public Management, Austin Peay State Univer-

programmes in Bangladesh even before the creation of BPATC. Yet, there are those informed individuals who have clearly pointed out that in spite of it establishment and institutional proliferation, the approaches to the design and implementation of the core PAT programmes have essentially remained archaic and often irrelevant to the changing needs and priorities of a growing civil service. The decline of governmental capability to provide meaningful and relevant training to those who need it most has been one of the major disappointments of the '80s and '90s. It is, therefore, presumptuous at best, on the part of the NTC, to claim that the makeshift draft PATP will somehow be capable of providing an operational framework.

It is fair to suggest that there had been no dearth of PAT institutions, nor had there been a paucity of training

actual needs and aspirations of their clienteles. The draft PATP make the civil service system more responsive.

Although there are some laws and procedures in Bangladesh to deal with administrative abuses including fraud and corruption, the political leadership has not successfully developed a process of putting a lid on the rudderless bureaucracy through the judicious use of "objective responsibility". On the other hand, the corrup-

tion-ridden public bureaucracies have also miserably failed to develop means of internal control through voluntary adherence to "subjective responsibility" (assurance of administrative compliance or responsiveness through adoption and implementation of various "internal controls" such as professional code of ethics, ethical leadership, ethical climate within the organisation, open communication and participatory type of management and decisionmaking process within the organisation, transparency, and citizen participation). There is no doubt that the absence of both the external and internal controls, most of the public bureaucracies in Bangladesh have remained immune from meaningful public scrutiny.

'Accountability' refers to the fact that bureaucrats must be

T's good that the guns have fallen silent along

the LoC. Good too if there is less aimless shell-

ing on the Siachen Glacier which surely must be

It will be a good sign if Hurriyat leaders come to

Pakistan and hold talks with officials here and with

the leaders of the so-called jihadi organizations. But

this flurry of activity should fool no one. None of it

war. Never was except when impulsiveness drove

Pakistan into unwinnable wars. The choice is

between no-peace and no-war. This was the situa-

tion obtaining till 1989 when the Kashmiri people

rose in revolt against India. If the current moves

lead anywhere the best that can be hoped for is a

return to the pre-1989 situation, with the Kashmir

problem as unresolved as it is today but with a

modicum of calm returning to the Kashmir Valley.

India clearly stands to gain from this process. What

its army in Kashmir has been unable to win its

Pakistan's advantage? In other words, what is Paki-

stan hoping to achieve from the current illusion of

progress? Surely not a final settlement of the Kash-

passes for the Pakistani establishment otherwise

we would not be in the mess we are but no one can

be so foolish as to think that given goodwill and

whatnot (the usual claptrap of weak or confused

diplomacy), a final settlement of Kashmir is around

the corner or is even a realistic proposition. India

will never accept that and Pakistan is not in a posi-

So the next question is should Pakistan still be

interested in the current moves knowing that, apart

from clearing the atmosphere (a good enough thing

in itself) and dampening the spirit of jihad, these

can bear no other fruit? The answer to this question

is a harsh one: even if Pakistan knows that India is

beating about the bush and has no interest in a just

solution of the Kashmir dispute, it should still go

for the illusion of peace because no other choice lies

The stark truth is that jihad (a term being used

loosely here) has no future in Kashmir. This is a

mir dispute. There is no shortage of fools in what

The question is: will the end of militancy be to

diplomatic overtures will achieve.

tion to change this.

before it.

The choice in Kashmir is not between peace and

will or can lead to a Camp David on Kashmir.

the most foolish battlefield in the world.

ensures that "public business" must be conducted in public view. In the closed-door decisionmaking process in Bangladesh, the citizens and the civil society are kept out by design. The absence of transparency in the public organizations breeds corruption. This also leads to lack of accountability and responsibility for the very decision which is being taken by the bureaucrats behind closed door.

In the absence of a transparent mode of decision making process, the public bureaucracy in Bangladesh has often been left to its own zany rules, procedures, devices, and preferences in determining controls over government service delivery pro-It is difficult to comprehend how the draft PATP is going to provide a way out to get rid of the heritage and culture of

It seems that the draft PATP seeks toward building up an "honest" and a "committed public service." While an honest public service means an ethical and equitable administration of public policies and programmes, a 'committed public service' connotes a public service in which the public managers (administrators) are expressly committed to the public interest. In other words, an ethically anchored public service should integrating ethics into the operations of public agencies in some countries. The principal training institutions in Bangladesh may test design some training programmes in the management and compliance of ethics in public organisations. Yet, the extent of corruption is so pervasive and deep rooted in Bangla-desh, no ethical training can get rid of a culture of incompetence, arrogance, secrecy, nepotism favoritism, collusion, and embezzlement from the civil service system. It will be difficult for the draft PATP or, for that matter, any training institute to transform a run-away and collusive bureaucracy into "an honest and committed public service".

Prime Minister Sheikh Hasina emphasized the importance of public administration training by telling the NTC in its sixth meeting on December 20, 2000 that "there is no alternative to training for government officials to run the administration effec-Well, such nice words tively." might sound intuitively pleasing. But, the reality in Bangla desh belies such rhetoric, and it is an open secret that sycophancy, political connections or affiliations to the ruling party are often treated as an "alternative" to training. The way the dures of the PSC have recently

ties and research activities so that the government (training) institutions become competent enough to impart quality train-Doubtless, such stipulations from the NTC in the form of policy statements can generate genuine enthusiasm toward revamping the existing training institutions. Yet, it is quite worthwhile to underscore that the government had pursued training

appropriate infrastructure

facilities, capacity of the facul-

programmes throughout '70s. 80s and 90s in the total absence of any reality-based National Training Policy (NTP) even though draft versions of NTP were adopted in 1984 and 1986. It needs to be pointed out that the draft versions of NTP of 1984 or 1986 could not be treated as a comprehensive national training policy for pursuing job-relevant training objectives. Those socalled drafts of NTP had failed to provide any operational standard or guidance to the PAT institutions for the purpose of designing and implementing useful training programmes. The track record of the NTC in the task of formulating and implementing a workable NTP is less than impressive. Since the issuance of a draft NTP in 1984, the NTC took almost seventeen long years to come up with yet

Kashmir and Power of Illusion

by Ayaz Amir



All health information to keep you up to date

Facts and fiction

Asthma: Some facts

TOM & JERRY

Knowing when your asthma is getting worse: If your symptoms increase and this may mean more wheezing

coughing or shortness of breath. Or you may be coughing and wheezing at night or waking up with these symptoms. If you find you have trouble sleeping at night.

If you need to use your vronchodilator more, or if it does not seem to be improving your asthma as well it used to. If you best PEF readings are getting lower, or the difference

between the best and worse PEF is getting nearer. Facts and fallacies: I can avoid getting asthma by taking better care of my health

and avoiding certain foods. False: Your asthma is not caused by something you did or did not do. You just happen to have lungs that are too sensitive to certain trigger. Although there is no cure for asthma, there is a lot you can do to control this condition and lead a normal life. Smoking will affect my asthma

True: Cigarette smoke is a common trigger factor for asthma attacks, whether the smoke comes from your own cigarette or other people's cigarette. Smoking damages the air passages of the lungs and worsens your breathing difficulties. Quit smoking. Women with asthma should not get pregant

False: Having asthma should not prevent one from having a baby. By taking good care of yourself and following your doctor's advice, you should have no problems with asthma during delivery and have a normal, healthy baby.

Next: Commonly asked questions and other tips

harsh thing to say given the blood spilt and the sacrifices rendered but, unfortunately, all too true. continuation of the insurgency can bleed India, as has done with creditable results over the past decade, damage Indian prestige and keep the Valley unsettled. But it cannot secure the liberation of the state. This much should be clear from the history of the last 53 years. What the Pakistan army has failed to secure in full-fledged battle the jihadis cannot hope to achieve with their hit-and-run tactics.

The jihadi organizations have their strengths otherwise the Indian army would have crushed them a long time ago but they also have their weaknesses. Much like the Afghan resistance they lack unity and have no central political organization. But this is not the point. Even if these weaknesses were overcome there would still be no military

solution to the Kashmir problem. It is also facile to think that jihad in Kashmir will bring India to the negotiating table. India has always been prepared for talks on peripheral issues, talks lacking substance and skirting the Kashmir issue. From the current moves what we are likely to get at the most is more of the same another round of inconsequential talks, whether at the level of foreign secretaries or, given luck, at a higher level. Surely the purpose of jihad cannot be to secure such exercises in futility.

Pakistan's predicament, however, is altogether different. Far from achieving anything, the jihadi line is creating problems for Pakistan at home. Look, what we reaped in Afghanistan. Unwittingly and for small gains, we entered that conflict holding on to the coattails of the United States. For the US Afghanistan is a distant memory while for us it is a damaging reality casting long shadows on our national existence.

Was it for drugs, guns and unwanted refugees that we fought that jihad? What is more, involvement in that conflict nurtured the seeds of religious militancy. The creed propounded in the seminaries which now dot the land, and whose growth is one consequence of that jihad, may not lead to the green banner of Islam flying over Chechnya or the Central Asian republics but it has contributed to the spread of intolerance and bigotry within Pakistan. Democracy already was a weak sapling. Now it must compete for survival with more noxious weeds. Much the same fallout can be detected with

regard to Kashmir. The jihadi organizations, exemplars of great sacrifice (let us never forget this), cannot wrest Kashmir from Indian hands but their growing presence is colouring the political waters in Pakistan. The political parties stand discredited. The army is in the process of discrediting itself. The religious parties think they alone remain to be tested and that their hour has arrived. In elections. it is true, they stand no chance. But elections will be of consequence if democracy returns, not as long as is banished and treated as a soiled commodity. Besides, the consciousness of armed strength (for many of the religious parties have their armed cadres) lends added strength and confidence to their voices. Is there anything more dangerous than soldiers returning from a war, especially a lost war?

On whom will they turn their guns and anger? Looking carefully we might just see that it is not India which is making any concessions but Pakistan which is trying to wash away the stigma of "crossborder terrorism" and undo the larger damage wrought by the folly of Kargil, Because of Kargil we painted ourselves as irresponsible. Now we are trying extra hard to prove our peaceful intentions. This has been the history of Pakistan: plunging into adventures and then trying to recover from the consequences. One step forward, several back.

As long as the Kashmir insurgency was largely a ome-grown affair the advantage was ours and the odium India's. But then in a replay of Afghanistan we had to bring the Kashmiri resistance under the wings of the ISI, which meant that the Pakistanbased jihadi organizations began overshadowing the Kashmiri element. Added to this was the national inability to keep a low profile when circumstances so dictated. Just as Dr A. Q. Khan has never been able to resist the spotlights, none of the jihadi organizations has been able to stop itself from proclaiming its deep involvement in Kashmir.

Thus what should have remained a Kashmiri affair became a Pakistani headache, with the international community less willing to put faith in Pakistan's protestations of innocence. Other countries handle these things with greater discretion. Syria never made a tamasha out of its support for the Hezbollah in Lebanon. Somehow such subtlety has always seemed beyond us. Then, of course, came the brilliance of Kargil which overnight transformed the oppressor (India) into the aggrieved

Anyhow, the damage having been done what remains is to salvage something from the debris. But to repeat the earlier point, the shadow-boxing now on display will lead to nothing. After all, since when did losers in every sphere win victories at the negotiating table? Even so, Pakistan must grasp the only thing on offer, the illusion of peace, and pretend that a great diplomatic opportunity awaits it if only to turn its gaze inwards and fight the jihads within that are clamouring to be fought.

Shouldn't we first put our house in order? We cannot make ends meet and yet must play with lordly ambitions nuclear status, missiles and a lot of pretentious stuff which passes for foreign policy. Our ambitions are not grandiose but foolish, with no connection to reality. Let us manage our own affairs better. Let us strive to achieve political stability. Let us invest a bit more in education and address the causes of our backwardness. Then with what remains let us fight more distant battles.

This does not mean we give up on Kashmir. Nor does it mean we kowtow to anyone. May the mountains come to the sea before we do that. Did China give up its claim to Hong Kong? Has it changed its policy towards Taiwan? We too must stick to what we believe in while at the same time keeping our feet on the ground and recognizing that being aware of one's limitations is no weakness and being driven by false pretensions no sign of strength.

But for this to happen the redoubts of the old thinking the thinking born of the Afghan involvement must be assaulted. Within the Pakistani establishment there are powerful elements which still subscribe to the Hamid Gul and Maulana Samiul Haq schools of foreign policy nonsense. Unless these elements are reduced to their proper places not much hope can be entertained of the scales falling from our eyes.

Courtesy the "Dawn" of Pakistan





