

Unhelpful Rigidity

OPPOSITION leader Begum Khaleda Zia has spurned Prime Minister Sheikh Hasina's offer for talks on some 'specific demands'. Her rejection sounded extremely abrasive because she said she would have a dialogue with the government but solely for the purpose of working out its resignation and not for resolving any differences with it. She has communicated all this to US Ambassador John C. Holzman who, while calling on her on Tuesday, wanted to know her reaction to the PM's latest offer for a dialogue. As if to leave no room for ambiguity about her inflexibility she has gone a step further adding if the offer were officially made she would be ready to discuss modalities for implementing her demand for the government's instant resignation. Her determination to carry on with outst-the-government-movement through intensified agitations has been reiterated in no unmistakable terms.

If the opposition leader's response to the PM's latest dialogue offer has been so caustic because of the Prime Minister's critical pointer to her 'confusing demands' then one has to say that this is a dangerous overreaction.

Why should the ruling party be participating in a dialogue that would be solely geared to addressing the agenda of its undoing and self-liquidation? We are concerned about this no-holds-barred obduracy on the part of the principal opposition party leader. When the BNP was in power the opposition AL had stuck to its one-point demand seeking resignation of the incumbent government but everybody remembers it too well that the then BNP government could serve its term of office despite AL's threat. BNP is playing the reverse role now in asking for the ouster of the AL government but the latter will not be toppled just for the asking as the 1991-96 BNP government was not.

By pressing for such unconstitutional and unrealistic demand what the BNP is precipitating is chaos and instability in the country. What is bound to happen is more hartal and more anarchy. We urge them, therefore, to pull back from the brink of an imminent politico-economic disaster. Instead, they should talk electoral reform and the forthcoming local self-government polls to participate in them.

Endangered Tanguar Haor

ON paper, the Tanguar Haor along the border in Sunamganj is an ecologically critical area (ECA). Moreover, a ministry of environment and forest proposal to declare the 9725-hectare wetland, an abode for some 250 species of the animal kingdom, a Ramsar site, was submitted to the prime minister's office last week. Also, the ministry has written letters to the land and local government ministries, and others concerned "for retaining the wetland's status as ECA and not to renew a lease which expired last December." Unfortunately, the reality is: some influential people with blessing from political high-ups have the land ministry under serious pressure to get their files on leasing of the haor cleared. In case the land ministry do approve renewal of the lease, which remains a strong possibility, it would only herald a disaster for the wetland. In a haste to get their money's worth before the government declares it a Ramsar site, the lessee, as put by an international Union for Conservation of Nature (IUCN) expert, "would be tempted to reap a quick harvest in the dry season going for part by part draining of the wetland and catch all the fish."

According to a study report done by the National Conservation Strategy, the wetland would lose its natural character if leased out for indiscriminate fishing. Already, there has been a sharp decline in fish population due to over-fishing. Besides, depletion of reed and swamp forest also threatens endangered birds like the Pallas's Eagle. Leasing out of the wetland would not only expose the 17 species of fish to the risk of extinction but also threaten the country's lone surviving swamp forest of hijal, karach, gunjikanta and chhonggrass.

As a signatory to the Ramsar Convention which seeks better conservation of the wetlands worldwide, the government must make sure that the haor does not fall victim to human greed. The land ministry should by no means renew the lease. We hope the prime minister would declare the Tanguar Haor a Ramsar site soon and issue directive to the ministry concerned for an integrated conservation plan.

Corruption in District Hospitals

ANOTHER batch of forty employees, of the health department, including civil surgeons and others, has been recommended for punishment by the parliamentary sub-committee on completion of their investigation into their conduct. A report in an influential Bangla daily had revealed instances of corruption in the offices of civil surgeons in many district-towns of the country. A similar report by the sub-committee saw around thirty employees of the health department, including six civil surgeons, losing their jobs on corruption charges.

In the first phase, this committee investigated allegations of corruption in the utilisation of funds in 17 districts and found discrepancies in the expenditure in Jessore, Bagerhat, Sherpur, Patuakhali and Munshiganj. In the second phase, investigations were carried out in some other districts and malpractices were detected between 1996 and 98 in Satkhira, Gopalganj, Faridpur, Madaripur, Rangpur and Tangail. The report says that the allegations proved correct in the second phase were almost similar to those for which a number of civil surgeons and other officials and employees had lost their jobs in the first phase. The 'selection committee' in these hospitals purchased medical and surgical appliances and equipment and furniture at unbelievable prices in collusion with a bunch of unscrupulous officials at the health and finance ministries who moved the files with the speed of lightning and got the financial sanctions and approvals in place.

We highly commend the good work done by the parliamentary sub-committee and urge the government to take stern measures against the offenders. The government should try to recover the stolen money from the culprits through legal means.

For Whom are Our Cities?

by Dr Shayer Ghafur

In events like slum eviction, the development agenda of the urban poor is lost to different vested interests. Rather than subjects of development, the urban poor become the objects of development (for others) without any say in the affairs that aim to change their life.

most often take place to control and have access to its limited resources. Various urban administrations serve the cause of the elite and powerful sections of society; an unholy alliance exists between the authorities and vested interest groups. Use and abuse of policies, rules and regulations in practice, among others, are the tools for favour. The urban poor, without exceptions, have always been the deprived majority.

Preliminary findings of a recently concluded study, by a three-member team, which carried out a survey in 800 households in Dhaka state that per capita income of Dhaka dwellers has doubled in the last seven years (1991-1998) — from US\$ 415 to US\$ 843. A very good news indeed! But a closer scrutiny unfolds a different picture — an increasing gap between the rich and the poor. To describe how this increase in per capita income is not homogeneous among all Dhaka dwellers, a few selected findings are summarised below.

- Income Figure: The average per capita income for all slum dwellers (with legal and illegal tenure) is a meagre US\$ 253 while US\$ 1110 is for the non-slum dwellers. In this period, the rates of increase among slum and non-slum dwellers are 6 and 11 per cent respectively.
- Income Share: In 1998, the lower 40 per cent households (determined on the basis of income) hold only 11 per cent of the total income generated in Dhaka. Whereas upper 10 per cent high-income households share 42 per cent of the generated income.
- Increasing Disparity: Despite increase in per capita income, gap between rich and poor is widening in Dhaka. The share of total income generated by the lower 40 per cent households came down to 11 per cent in 1998 from 17 per cent in 1991. Whereas, this figure for the upper 5 per cent households has almost doubled from 17 per cent to 31 per cent during this period.
- Reasons for Disparity: Less income from businesses and commerce and fixed assets contributed to half and one-fourth of all disparity respectively.

Seeds of (urban) income disparity are embedded in the poor people's initial fixed asset disparity. In Dhaka, the lower 50 per cent households control only 7 per cent of all fixed assets. Whereas, the upper 5 per cent households control 40 per cent.

Despite these negative figures, an improvement in the magnitude of the urban poverty has been noticed. In 1998, 30 per cent of the Dhaka City population were estimated by this study to live below poverty level (i.e. 19% urban poor and 11% hardcore poor level). During 1991, this figure was 69 per cent (i.e. 42% urban poor and 27% hardcore poor). The change in figure implies that more than half of the urban poor came out of their poverty in seven years. Where do these people live? According to the findings of this study, 87 per cent of the urban poor live in slums and 19 per cent outside slums. How this improvement was made possible? The urban poor, women in particular, were targeted by different government and NGO interventions. Slum improvement Project (SIP), an integrated basic service delivery initiative by the LGED is worth mentioning. This was acknowledged as the 'Best Practices' in Bangladesh by the Habitat II.

These facts and figures leave us to be critical of the view that sees slums only as dens of crime and violence — the alleged key reason for slum eviction.

Whose Good is Good?

In the event of state's repeated slum evictions, and its intention for rehabilitation through 'housing provision', will the poorer sections of the city be given a fair deal? Before addressing how good the eviction/rehabilitation will be for the affected groups, let us first understand what good these actions will bring to others. The following list is not exhaustive.

- General public will be benefited with an improvement in the overall crime situation. This is not a highly disputed proposition if we accept that slums and only slums are the dens of crime in the city.
- Eviction will put an end to the illegal consumption of public utilities and in turn,

will benefit the taxpayers. True indeed if we establish that slum dwellers are the key culprits causing mammoth system loss to various public utilities.

- Eviction will result in the recovery of prime Khas urban land, resulting in public appropriation. We agree and hope that the eviction also takes place in areas controlled by the elements within the ruling party. We also hope that this act of recovery sets a precedence for the repossession of recently reported 364 acres of 'depossession' land in Dhaka. By repossession we do not mean selling those lands afterwards for shopping centres and apartments.

- There will be an improvement in the face of the city, to the hygienic and aesthetic taste of the non-slum dwellers. But the question remains whether only the bastees and jhupries are restricting Dhaka towards becoming ill-totoma.

- Relocation project arising from eviction will boost already booming (housing) construction sector. A good number of the urban poor will find their employment during construction of these flats. But can someone guarantee their allotment to, and continued living by the urban poor — the alleged beneficiaries — defying the forces of gentrification?

We are quite confident to answer 'not positive' regarding benefits of eviction and rehabilitation to the slum dwellers; hardly any case studies, inside-outside Bangladesh, exist that comply with these actions. This author addressed this issue before and will not repeat due to shortage of space ('Multistorey Slums? Bad News for Petty-producers', The Daily Star (DS), 6.6.98). However, one particular citation is hard to resist.

In late 1974, the squatter population had reached a not-so-high 14 per cent of the urban population in Dhaka. In January 1975, 172,589 squatters were evicted. A housing expert lamented: "By this time, other countries with similar and more serious squatter problems, were taking a more benevolent view. Bangladesh, however, enthusiastically pursued a series of misguided poli-

cies which were not only ineffective, but also alienated a large proportion of the low-income community. What became known as the Squatter Rehabilitation Programme, based on a number of resettlement camps located far to the periphery of economic opportunities within the informal sector, was at odds with earlier ideals and policies. Furthermore, they were totally in conflict with the lessons which were being learned internationally" (Charles L. Choguill, 1993).

We are witnessing a misjudged exercise that will consequently result in alienating a large number of the urban poor for the benefit of others. We are pursuing an urbanisation of injustice. One can rightly speculate that the eviction/rehabilitation will not benefit the urban poor beneficiaries due to following observations:

First, certain elements in the state perceive the urban poor way of living as 'social pathology', they openly act for its 'social control', thus explicitly ignoring the issues of 'social justice'. For example: (a) Home Minister wished 'Strict measures would be taken for removing the slums which have become criminals' dens; and also "We can no longer think about them from humanitarian point of view only. They themselves have to solve their (accommodation) problems" (DS, 8.5.99). (b) A proposed macro-level stabilisation policy aims at discouraging the people to come to Dhaka without a place to stay (DS, 17.9.99).

Second, eviction threatens as well as presents an opportune premise for different special interest groups. For example: (a) In reaction against 'state-violence', NGOs seek legal justice to prevent eviction as they were about to lose their stake (e.g. it was reported that Tk. 1000 crore investments by various NGOs are in jeopardy due to slum evictions — DS, 27.8.99). This paper, however, duly acknowledges the good work done by various NGOs to bring positive change in the lives of the urban poor. (b) Specialist professionals suddenly were found in a rush to start proposing technical solutions requiring huge capital investments.

Conclusion

While cities have been appropriated by the elite for power and profit-making on the one hand and highly subsidised residential plots on the other hand, access to means of enjoying (minimal) fruits of urban life has continued to elude the poor. There is a conscious attempt to exclude the poor as unworthy urban dwellers; they are poor, they live in unhygienic conditions, and practices crime and violence.

If there exists a possibility where a group can improve, though slowly, their material condition by integrating into the urban dynamics, then where is the problem? Importantly, whose problem? Should not the state, the city authority, act in that case to create a responsive-setting for their betterment? Rationally and ideologically speaking, they should. But what we have been witnessing lately is a fallacy. The provider and protector accuse the victim (slum dwellers) for being poor and vulnerable! Isn't it their responsibility that poor people living in the margin dwell in properly serviced settlements, get good education and health facilities, sleep without fear of the masts, and earn a gainful livelihood? And make a city for all. They should if they abide by the Constitutional provision of this country, commitments to various UN charters, and promises made by the political leaders. But the seat of power is unresponsive — our urban reality. Arrogance continues to defy all majoritarian causes and values, and accumulated knowledge during the last three decades.

Low-income housing, in developing countries, is closely related to the concept of 'development'. Some 'core' development issues, e.g. employment generation, gender needs, and human rights, have been progressively placed at the forefront of 'housing' policies and strategies in addition to their 'shelter' emphasis. Low-income housing in a given developing country is a productive sector before being an emotive issue. This is an established fact. But in events like slum eviction, the development agenda of the urban poor is lost to different vested interests. Rather than subjects of development, the urban poor become the objects of development (for others) without any say in the affairs that aim to change their life. Slum dwellers become alien in their own country.

The author is a teacher at the Department of Architecture, BUET

The Website, the Widow and the War of Words

Whatever the Outcome of Polls Political Stability May Still Elude India

Computers are replacing graffiti, and colourful meetings are giving way to image consultants. But India's elections were still a heated affair. Gemini News Service went to the hustings to look at a campaign that was weak on policies and strong on personalities — particularly those of the two prospective prime ministers.

D K Joshi writes from Delhi



who informed their paymasters of the text of their rivals' impending advertisements or announcements. This enabled counter-information to be prepared and distributed in an attempt to neutralise the original message.

Most of the image-making focused on the respective party

leaders rather than on their parties. "You gave Congress 45 years," Vajpayee told voters, "give me just five."

The NDA relied on Vajpayee's image as the Prime Minister who 'won a war' against Pakistan in the Kargil area of Kashmir earlier this year. Advani and other senior

NDA leaders trumpeted Vajpayee's handling of the crisis, which they believed was their trump card.

And as it fears that Gandhi, the widow of assassinated prime minister Rajiv Gandhi, is the only hurdle between itself and the Delhi throne, it was waging a campaign against her. The party questioned her foreign origin and cast doubts on her educational and administrative qualifications for the top job. Vajpayee has called her a 'security threat'.

Congress, in turn, concentrated on demolishing Vajpayee's image, since he was the main vote-getter. Sonia Gandhi had responded to his criticisms with allegations — denied by Vajpayee — that he helped turn in freedom fighters to British police during India's independence campaign in the 1940s.

"My origin is Italian but my heart is Hindustani," she asserted on television.

"No-one can take away my love for the family and the country," she told a public meeting.

Those who call me a foreigner and pose themselves as saviours of the country were caught napping when the [Pakistani-backed] intruders

captured the peaks in the Kargil sector," she added.

She harped on the need for a stable government, arguing that Congress alone could provide stability.

Both Congress and BJP are prepared to contemplate a coalition government, if necessary, but Congress has fewer electoral partners to keep happy than its rivals. It can rely on the communist parties for support, because of their deep opposition to BJP policies they regard as ranged against Muslims and Christians and, therefore, socially divisive.

"To defeat BJP we have decided to side with Congress," said veteran communist leader Jyoti Basu, who is Chief Minister of West Bengal state.

In the water of personal attacks on innuendoes, issues such as poverty and the provision of water, health and education were eclipsed.

Another disquieting factor, said Brinda Karat, general secretary of the All-India Democratic Women's Association, was that "various parties have given over one-third of Lok Sabha seats to people with criminal records, but not even 10 per cent to women."

With such trends, whatever the outcome of the Lok Sabha polls, political stability may still elude India.

The writer is a veteran Indian journalist. He worked for the Bombay Free Press Journal, and now freelances.

To the Editor...

The government should put its priorities right

Sir, We have learnt that the government is going to build 600 apartments to accommodate the guests attending the NAM conference to be held in Dhaka in the year 2001. Six five-star hotels will also be built for this purpose, and a large number of cars will be imported for the use of the guests.

So it is quite clear that millions of taka will be spent if the government sticks to the plan for holding this conference. It is learnt that NAM has lost its previous glory and therefore, no other country showed interest to hold the conference. Then why all of a sudden, our government became so interested is not clear to us.

This reminds us the way the government evicted the poor slum-dwellers from their abode without providing them any shelter. These poor people are also the citizens of this country and, therefore, have a right to food and shelter.

What benefit our country will achieve from this conference? Moreover, after the conference, the centre, the five-star hotels and the cars will become useless and incur further expenditure for maintenance.

So, we urge the government to drop the plan and instead use the money to build houses for the evicted slum-dwellers and other projects which will be helpful for our country and the people.

Nur Jahan Chittagong

Voter registration

Sir, In our country, to become a candidate in an election to the parliament, registration as a voter is not always necessary. Disqualified persons to become an MP, FEMA, a citizens' coalition, recommended that a person not registered as a voter be declared disqualified to participate in such election. In our neighbouring countries, person not registered as voter is even disqualified to contest in any election.

However, many agreed that a candidate for election must be a voter but some insisted that he should be a voter of any constituency of the country while others pleaded that his or her name must appear in the voter list of the constituency where he or she is contesting in election as a candidate.

Mostafa Sohel Dhaka

Ban hartal

Sir, In the past, as far as I remember, there were referendums on certain issues. The issues may have been illogical to many extents, and may have gone in favour of tyrant rulers.

But in my opinion, one such referendum has become necessary in the present-day backdrop.

There should be a 'yes-no' vote to ban hartal. No matter, which political party is in power, there must not be any more hartals.

We want Bangladesh to go forward, not backward.

Sadia Momtaj Chittagong

Floor-crossing

Sir, The Election Commission has set October 11, 99 for its verdict in the controversial floor-crossing by two BNP MPs who had joined the AL as ministers. Chief Election Commissioner Mohammad Abu Hena is heading the three-member commission to settle the cases against these two MPs. The people are eagerly waiting for a neutral but pragmatic decision on this highly sensitive issue.

To restrict floor-crossing of the MPs objecting to practice a

sustainable culture in the country's politics, all the political parties passed the bill (Section 70 of the Constitution) unanimously in 1991. Section 70 says, "If an MP supports a political party against the party he belongs, will lose his membership..." I believe they not only voted in favour of the bill but also agreed in principle.

However, there might have been some shortcomings of the bill and might contradict some of the Sections of the Constitution.

Hence, I would request the CEC to give a verdict against the MPs considering the principle and suggest the political parties accordingly.

Mustafizur Rahman Dhaka

Congrats to Bangladesh

Sir, Let me congratulate the Bangladesh football team which has just become champion in the SAF Games in Katmandu. We have been waiting for this day for a long time. Now there lays a huge responsibility on our shoulder. Those who are now playing in the national team and those who are potential players, must not think that it is the end of the journey. In

fact, our journey has just begun.

Shaheen Kalyanpur, Dhaka

Pirated CDs

Sir, This is an appeal against the pirated CDs widely available in our country. For the past few years there has been an extraordinary rise in importing pirated CDs. Pirated music and games CDs as well as software CDs and Video CDs (VCD) piracy are common in our country these days. These pirated CDs come mainly from Taiwan, Thailand and China and there is a huge demand of pirated CDs in the market as each pirated music CDs cost only Tk 200 or even less whereas each original CD costs Tk 500 to Tk 700. Games pirated CDs cost Tk 250 whereas the original CDs cost more than Tk 500. Then who would not be tempted to buy pirated CDs?

But these CDs should not be used for a number of reasons. First of all its quality is not up to the standard. Sometimes the sound of these CDs is not good enough.

Moreover, it's illegal to copy from a CD, where it's written clearly "All Rights Reserved". But in Dhaka, behind the Bairat Mukarram Mosque pirated

video CDs can be bought illegally and the authority is not doing anything about it.

But countries like Germany and Hong Kong have taken legal actions against those who are involved in piracy business.

If these countries can do it, then why can't we?

Rizwan Hussain Jabbar Dhanmondi

Mosquito menace at Uttara

Sir, In recent weeks, mosquitoes have increased to an indescribable extent at Uttara. As the evening approaches, these tiny but powerful insects begin to come out in large numbers and invade all places. As a result, students cannot concentrate on studies and people cannot spend a quiet evening. The workers of garments factories are the worst sufferers as they cannot work comfortably at all.

It is also reported that many dreadful diseases such as dengue, cerebral malaria etc., may spread by mosquitoes. But it is strange that there is no sign to fight this menace as yet.

Will the authorities concerned do something to control this troublesome pest?

Abdul Kadir Plot#7, Road#11, Sector#3 Uttara, Dhaka-1230.