

Law and Our Rights

Sexual Harassment at DU: Towards a Code of Conduct

by A H Monjurul Kabir

We, as a whole have to shrug off the taboos which shroud the crime of rape and sexual harassment. The Jahangirnagar syndrome amply testifies our inherent bias towards rapists and their political connection. That also proves the inefficiency of constitutional protection for fundamental human rights and the dignity and worth of human person. The present movement against sexual harassment at DU again reminds us of our sheer failure to provide a compass free from this sort of perversion.

THE recent allegation of sexual harassment by a female student against a male teacher of Dhaka University again brought the nation into utter disgrace. The whole nation was shamed by the worst revelation of twenty rapes and over three hundred cases of sexual harassment at Jahangirnagar University (JU) just a few months ago. Now the same syndrome rocked the conscience of the nation. Country's highest citadel of knowledge, Dhaka University topped the headlines for last

several days not for any breakthrough in research or innovation. It is in the news for allegations of sexual harass-

ment and untoward incidents marked by violence between two rival groups of students following the allegations. What a shame!

Unfortunately students of the varsity failed to stage their protest uniformly. Two groups of students i.e. Students Protesting Sexual Harassment (SPSH) and 'Conscious Students' (CS) are vehemently confronting each other though both of them are against sexual harassment! But in the name of 'Conscious Students' some students used force to silence the grievances of 'Students Protesting Sexual Harassment' which is not acceptable in any consideration. Whether they are trying to protect interests of any vested quarter has now become a common question. It is really a matter of pity that even on important issue like this, students of Dhaka University could not take a united stand. They are being successfully used by some influential lobbies for their petty personal interests.

The whole episode of sexual harassment creates embarrassment both for teachers and students. The conventional 'teacher-student' relationship based on mutual trust faces a major set back. In fact, it is now passing a transitional period.

The issue of sexual harassment, this time, infact opens the Pandora's box. The fact that it is still a taboo does not deny its widespread existence in workplace including educational institutions. It is now admitted by all quarters that it does exists in Dhaka University for quite a long time. The problem lies with the dangers of talking about sexual harassment.

What is Sexual Harassment?

The term sexual harassment is rarely used, recognised or understood in Bangladesh. In a society which is essentially male dominated and patriarchal, sexual harassment may include any inappropriate behaviour with sexual connotations or overtones and which may include touching, stalking, teasing, making insinuating remarks, showing of obscene materials e.g. pornographic magazine and so forth. The main component is that the woman is made to feel uncomfortable, scared or intimidated.

'Sexual harassment therefore need not even involve touch it can be a look or a comment, and by such behaviour a woman is duly put in her place' (Carol Smart, 1995, Law, Crime & Sexuality: Essays in Feminism).

In the west, sexual harassment at work includes sexual bullying, obscene language, name-calling, gestures, the display of pictures, jokes, teasing or treats.

The intention of the perpetrator is completely irrelevant — what matters is that the activity is unwanted by the woman who lodged the complaint. Usually, sexual harassment is an accumulation of little things each of which taken alone, is subtle and ambiguous but their cumulative effect is to turn a woman into a sexual object.

Still a Social Taboo

As already mentioned it is still a social taboo. For the first time in the history of Bangladesh, students, particu-

larly female students speak out on such 'dangerous' issue. It can be dangerous for a number of reasons:

a) Sexual harassment raises questions about personal relationship which is deepestrooted and can be very disturbing at a profound emotional level.

b) It can construct women as victims and usually it does so.

c) Identifying and speaking about sexual harassment can lead to women being spoken for; if they are victims, they can not speak for themselves.

d) It can lead to a violent reaction or adverse social reparation and finally

e) It carries the risk of exposing women negatively in the media and other social forums.

While the dangers of talking about sexual harassment are clear, not talking about it is even more dangerous, because silence allowing it to continue, even encourages the perpetrator to continue it. The silence of women send a wrong signal to others too. The cases of such harassment of Jahangirnagar University and of Dhaka University profusely proves that. So women must speak out firmly. It sheds light on and exposes those others and thus can help to end them. Even though some sexual harassment cases are lost, the publicity of each one can assist other women who are being sexually abused. It encourages them to speak out. It also acts as an antidote to some future occurrence.

Sexual Harassment: A Human Rights Issue

In many parts of the world including the Asian Region documenting sexual harassment as a human rights issue describes such conduct in the following terms:

a) 1. A clear manifestation of violence against women

b) 2. A violation of human rights

c) 3. An affront to the dignity of the person harassed

d) 4. Having a link with the inequality of women in social and economic spheres

e) 5. Unacceptable conditions of work which have detrimental effects for both the employer and the enterprise.

f) 6. Inconsistent with the very nation of fundamental freedoms

Recently the Supreme Court of India on a writ (Vishak v. State of Rajasthan 1997, 6 Sec 241) filed by NGOs laid down guidelines to obviate sexual harassment in view of the increase of cases reported. These guidelines are to operate at places of work including universities, hospitals and other professional bodies. In the absence of legislation, the court has held that the guidelines shall be legally binding and enforceable. The Indian Supreme Court has very significantly brought sexual harassment within the purview of human rights violations.

The Verdict

As already mentioned in view of the increase of cases reported on sexual harassment of women, the Supreme Court of India, on a writ has laid down guidelines to obviate such harassment at places of work, and at other institutions including universities, hospitals and other professional bodies. With

respect to employment, the guidelines are applicable to the government, public, and private sector, and cover women drawing a salary or an honorarium or working as volunteers. The court has directed all employers and other responsible persons in workplaces and other institutions to ensure the prevention of sexual harassment of women and to provide procedures for resolution, settlement and prosecution of acts sexual harassment. Most significant, the Supreme Court has brought sexual harassment within the purview of human rights violations.

Definition

Sexual harassment is unwelcome sexually determined behaviour, direct or by implication, and includes: physical contact and advances, a demand or request for sexual favours, sexually coloured remarks, showing pornography, any other unwelcome physical, verbal or non-verbal conduct of sexual nature.

Acts of sexual harassment can be humiliating, can create a hostile work environment and may constitute a health and safety problem for women. Employers and responsible persons need to ensure that a woman objecting to harassment is not disadvantaged in respect to her employment and promotion.

Prevention

In order to prevent the occurrence of sexual harassment, the Court has directed employers and persons in charge of the workplace to take the following steps:

a) Express prohibition of sexual harassment as defined above at the workplace should be notified, published and circulated in appropriate ways.

b) The Rules/regulations of Government and Public Sector bodies relating to conduct and discipline should include rules/regulations prohibiting sexual harassment and provide for appropriate penalties in such rules against the offender.

c) As regards private employers steps should be taken to include the aforesaid prohibitions in the standing orders under the Industrial Employment (Standing Orders) Act, 1946.

d) Appropriate work conditions should be provided in respect of work, leisure, health and hygiene to further ensure that there is no hostile environment towards women at work places and no employee women should have reasonable grounds to believe that he is disadvantaged in connection with her employment.

Complaints

Employers are expected to set up within their organization an appropriate complaints mechanism. The court has recommended provision for a complaints committee, a special counsellor and other support services for handling complaints. With respect to the committee, the following guidelines have been laid down:

The committee is to be headed by a woman. At least half of the committee members should be women. To prevent undue pressure from within the organization, the committee should include a third party representative from an NGO or

any other body conversant with the issue of sexual harassment. The complaint should be handled confidentially and within a time bound framework. The committee is required to submit an annual report to the concerned government department. Employers and persons in charge are required to report to the appropriate Government Department regarding compliance with the aforesaid Guidelines.

Disciplinary Action

Where such conduct amounts to misconduct in employment as defined by the relevant service rules, appropriate disciplinary action should be initiated by the employer in accordance with those rules.

Other Provisions

In addition to preventive and remedial measures, the Court has also stressed the need for awareness-raising in the workplace.

Employers should be allowed to raise issues of sexual harassment at workers' meetings and in other appropriate forums. Sexual harassment should be affirmatively discussed in employer — employee meetings. The guidelines stressing the rights of women workers must be prominently notified with those rules.

Criminal Law

In addition to the above the court has also addressed sexual harassment and criminal law remedies:

a) Where such conduct amounts to a specific offence under the Indian Penal Code or under any other law, the employer shall initiate appropriate action in accordance with law by making a complaint with the appropriate authority.

In particular, the employer should ensure that victims, or witnesses are not victimized or discriminated against while dealing with complaints of sexual harassment. The victims of sexual harassment should have the option to seek transfer of the perpetrator or their own transfer.

Prevention

Where sexual harassment occurs as a result of an act or omission by any third party or outside, the employer and person in charge will take all steps necessary and reasonable to assist the affected person in terms of support and preventive action.

These guidelines are binding and enforceable in law until such time as the Government passes appropriate legislation.

Towards a Code of Conduct for Bangladesh

We, as a whole have to shrug off the taboos which shroud the crime of rape and sexual harassment. The Jahangirnagar syndrome amply testifies our inherent bias towards rapists and their political connection. That also proves the inefficiency of constitutional protection for fundamental human rights and the dignity and worth of human person. The present movement against sexual harassment at DU again reminds us of our sheer failure to provide a compass free from this sort of perversion.

Sexual harassment in Bangladesh violates the consti-

tute piece of legislation can adequately deal with the whole gamut of sexual harassment. Like India, the Judiciary of Bangladesh can also play a strong role to fill the gaps in the absence of legislative provision. A public interest litigation can be initiated by the concerned NGOs in this regard. A code of conduct is a must to ensure safe environment of educational institutions and work places for women. We can not enter into next country with such pervasiveness of problems of sexual harassment.

Strategy to Combat Sexual Harassment at Dhaka University

We believe that sexual harassment is widespread and acceptable at Dhaka University. It is a particular problem because university teachers abuse their power and students do not feel able to report them in case their results are endangered. We have therefore chosen a strategy which will operate on a number of different levels. The key focus of this strategy is to develop (participatorily), a code of conduct on sexual harassment. However, we are aware that if this code does not have widespread support, it will just be a piece of paper. We will use the process of developing this code to develop support. As such this is a strategy aimed at the structural level within the Dhaka University set-up. Insofar as part of this strategy is focused on developing a code of conduct, we have also focused on the substantive level, or the level of the rules which operate within the university. Parts of the strategy are focused on raising awareness and therefore by implication on changing the behavior of the perpetrators. These aspects of the strategy focus on the cultural level.

Immediate Actions

1. In the short term we will identify like minded teachers both female and males who will support a Campaign against Sexual Harassment at Dhaka University and will build a network which includes them and human rights activists, NGO workers, and student leaders.

2. With this group, we will develop a standard code of conduct which sets out what is and what is not acceptable behaviour between students and teachers and between students and other students (with penalties when the code is contravened). This code will be developed in a workshop in which students will also participate.

3. The code of conduct will be printed and disseminated widely to educational institutions like colleges and universities.

4. Committees to be set up in all educational institutions comprising of teachers, students, lawyers, NGO activists. We will set up the first model committee in Dhaka University.

5. In addition to this consultative committee, there will be a student's consultative committee comprising of students who will identify the problems and possible solutions/recommendations to be given to the consultative committee. This committee will organize dialogues with political parties, student leaders, and teachers to identify non students in these institutions who usually perpetuate S H on campus and act to prevent it.

6. In conjunction with these committees we will begin developing training course for student advisers on what is and is not acceptable behaviour.

7. In conjunction with this we will conduct a series of awareness campaigns with students.

8. At the same time we will lobby through our personal contacts teachers and university authorities on the issue of taking sexual harassment seriously. A delegation will approach the authority concerned for immediate action on cases of S H among colleagues at the university campaign on the issue of sexual harassment. Sexual Harassment will be defined and described in accessible Bangla so that everyone understands clearly what is being discussed.

10. In conjunction with this we will begin developing training course for student advisers on what is and is not acceptable behaviour.

11. Student counselling will be provided for those who have been victimised. We will work jointly with those from the psychology department who are concerned about this issue.

12. A format for evaluation of teachers will be developed. Included in this format will be questions about whether teachers have behaved in a way that sexually harasses their students. (Confidentiality of students filling in this format should be maintained at any costs).

13. On the basis of these evaluations, it should be the duty of administrative heads of departments to give teachers who have been reported as infringing the code of behaviour confidential warnings without particulars of the victim. The warning should be followed by continued observation.

Action Plans for 3 months

Our general approach is to make this a Dhaka University issue, by involving formal university associations and committees and institutions as much as possible. The code of conduct (see point 1 above) will be read at academic committee meetings and discussed. Teachers, students, teachers' and students' associations will be involved as much as possible.

Strategy developed by 'Dhaka University Teachers and Students Group' presented by Prof. Ishrat Shamim, Soniya Nishat and Dr. C.R. Abrar at the Workshop on Acknowledgment of Sexual Harassment in Bangladesh held on 28 & 29 July, 1998 at the British Council, Bangladesh.

Almost twenty years have passed since the government of General Zia al-Haq, perhaps anxious to demonstrate its religious credentials after seizing power in a coup, slapped the Hudud Ordinances on Pakistan. One of the most notorious consequences of the change in Pakistan's penal code was the new law on rape, which made it difficult for women to prove they had been raped and dangerous for them even to try. The cardinal flaw of the provisions on rape, however, is not the problem of evidence at all. It is rather that rape under the Hudud ordinances is completely subsumed under the category of zina, or sex crimes (adultery and fornication). Rape is considered zina bil jaab, or 'zina by force'; if it is found that zina was committed under compulsion, the rapist is punished and the victim "excused." But by treating rape only as special case of zina, the laws open the way for the prosecution of women who cannot prove that the rape has occurred. That is exactly what happened in the infamous Safia Bibi case of 1983: an unmarried 18-year-old blind girl, pregnant after being raped by her landlord and landlord's son, could not prove her case (even under ta'zir) and was sentenced to whipping for extramarital sex; although the men she accused were acquitted, the courts ruled that her pregnancy confirmed for own guilt. After the mobilisation of national protest against the Hudud Ordinances' effect on women, in the past decade, Pakistan returned to civilian rule and elected its first woman prime minister. It also experienced a nationally publicised scandal in the early 1990s. The laws on rape, in this time, have been challenged repeatedly, not only by reference of international human rights standards but also by appeal to Islamic values and jurisprudence. Despite all of this, they remain on the books — a testament to the enduring power of patriarchal attitudes to masquerade as divine law.

What the Laws Are and Are Not

The common perception is that Pakistan's rape laws require the testimony of four pious adult male eyewitnesses to prove rape. That is only half the story. Although that almost impossible high threshold of evidence is required to convict someone of rape under the *hadd* category of Pakistani law, the Hudud ordinances include a second, and much more common, scheme of crime and punishment. This second level of the law, the *ta'zir*, derived from a category of Islamic jurisprudence applying to crimes for which specific rules were not defined in the Qur'an or sunnah, and for which greater human discretion was therefore permitted. Pakistani human rights lawyer Asma Jahangir

has frequently pointed out that many critics of the rape laws initially focused on the four-witnesses rules of *hadd*, ignoring the more complicated problem of rape under the *ta'zir* category. At this level of the law, the testimony of women is admissible, as is medical or forensic evidence, and there is no set standard of proof. Men could be, and have been, convicted of rape under these rules, even though widespread bias against the testimony of women in the courts persists.

The cardinal flaw of the provisions on rape, however, is not the problem of evidence at all. It is rather that rape under the Hudud ordinances is completely subsumed under the category of zina, or sex crimes (adultery and fornication). Rape is considered zina bil jaab, or 'zina by force'; if it is found that zina was committed under compulsion, the rapist is punished and the victim "excused." In other words, presumably to salvage her lost honour, the woman was to marry the man who raped her.

Susan Brownmiller, an American feminist who argued in *Against Our Will* (1975) that rape be treated not as a crime of "carnal knowledge" but one of aggression, wrote that ancient Hebrew civilisation treated

rape as a "theft of virginity," and as a property crime "against the male estate." Later Jewish laws were reformed to give women the option of rejecting marriage to the rapist and claiming the financial compensation for themselves — although such reforms were opposed by authorities like the eminent theologian Maimonides. Before Muslims congratulate ourselves that our scripture never authorised the attitude found in the Old Testament, we should ask ourselves which is worse — that a sacred text appears to sanctify injustice, or that a modern Muslim state legalises it — almost two thousand years later? One might also wonder which is worse: marriage to the rapist, according to the Hebrew code, or death — the preferred solution according to the extant feudal values in parts of Pakistan. When Jeihan Mina, another young rape victim in Pakistan whose case was converted into a zina offence, became pregnant, an uncle rescued her from her grandfather who wanted her killed. A woman's virtue is sometimes still seen as the collective possession of her family or clan, and its loss, even through rape, is reason for swift retribution.

These problems are part of an underlying social and cultural system, not the creation of the government or the Hudud ordinances. Yet rather than pass laws to improve the protection of women, the Islamic Republic of Pakistan has compounded injustice. Apparently, it finds it easier to let *Jaahiliyya* linger.

Not Islam

Since the early 1980s, however, the Hudud ordinances — and particularly its effect on rape — have been challenged in Pakistan on Islamic grounds. Many women activists in Pak-

istan mobilized against the laws in 1983 around the Safia Bibi case, protesting that they violated not just international human rights standards but also the spirit and letter of Islam